

1 Shortest Path in Between Two Points

Show that the shortest path between two points in three-dimensional space is that of a straight line. Hint: Use Euler's equations with several dependent variables $x(t)$, $y(t)$, and $z(t)$, with t being the independent variable.

1.0 solution

We minimize

$$J = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} ds = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} \sqrt{(dx)^2 + (dy)^2 + (dz)^2} \quad (1.1)$$

where dx , dy , and dz , are the differentials of the Cartesian coordinates x , y , and z respectively, and x_1 and x_2 correspond to two fixed positions in the Cartesian space. Since $x = x(t)$, $y = y(t)$, and $z = z(t)$, we have

$$dx = \frac{dx}{dt} dt \equiv x' dt \quad dy = \frac{dy}{dt} dt \equiv y' dt \quad dz = \frac{dz}{dt} dt \equiv z' dt. \quad (1.2)$$

So

$$J = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \sqrt{(x' dt)^2 + (y' dt)^2 + (z' dt)^2} = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2} dt, \quad (1.3)$$

where t_1 and t_2 are the corresponding values of the variable t at positions x_1 and x_2 . We define the functional

$$f = \sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2} \quad (1.4)$$

where we require that it satisfy the following Euler equations

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial x'} = 0 \quad \frac{\partial f}{\partial y} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial y'} = 0 \quad \frac{\partial f}{\partial z} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial z'} = 0, \quad (1.5)$$

which will make J at least stationary, but we will guess that it's a minimum. Doing this gives

$$0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{x'}{\sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}} \right) = 0 \quad 0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{y'}{\sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}} \right) = 0 \quad 0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{z'}{\sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}} \right) = 0, \quad (1.6)$$

which gives

$$\frac{x'}{\sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}} = C_1 \quad \frac{y'}{\sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}} = C_2 \quad \frac{z'}{\sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}} = C_3, \quad (1.7)$$

where C_1 , C_2 , and C_3 , are constants of integration. We may rewrite equations 1.7 as

$$\frac{x'}{C_1} = \sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2} \quad \frac{y'}{C_2} = \sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2} \quad \frac{z'}{C_3} = \sqrt{x'^2 + y'^2 + z'^2}. \quad (1.8)$$

So

$$\frac{x'}{C_1} = \frac{y'}{C_2} = \frac{z'}{C_3} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \frac{1}{C_1} \frac{dx}{dt} dt = \frac{1}{C_2} \frac{dy}{dt} dt = \frac{1}{C_3} \frac{dz}{dt} dt \quad \Rightarrow \quad \frac{1}{C_1} dx = \frac{1}{C_2} dy = \frac{1}{C_3} dz, \quad (1.9)$$

which may be integrated to give

$$\int \frac{1}{C_1} dx = \int \frac{1}{C_2} dy = \int \frac{1}{C_3} dz \quad \Rightarrow \quad \boxed{\frac{1}{C_1} x + C_4 = \frac{1}{C_2} y + C_5 = \frac{1}{C_3} z + C_6}, \quad (1.10)$$

which is a general equation of a straight line, where the integration constants may be adjusted to fit the line to the end points.

2 Stationary Integral

Find $y(x)$ such that the following integral is stationary,

$$J = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} \sqrt{x} \sqrt{1 + y'^2} dx, \tag{2.1}$$

where $y' \equiv \frac{dy}{dx}$.

2.0 solution

The functional

$$f = \sqrt{x} \sqrt{1 + y'^2} \tag{2.2}$$

must satisfy Euler's equation

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial y} - \frac{d}{dx} \frac{\partial f}{\partial y'} = 0, \tag{2.3}$$

where $y' \equiv \frac{dy}{dx}$. So

$$0 - \frac{d}{dx} \left(\sqrt{x} \frac{y'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) = 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{x} \frac{y'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} = c_1, \tag{2.4}$$

where we introduce the constant of integration c_1 . We may rewrite equation 2.4 as

$$\begin{aligned} \sqrt{x} y' = c_1 \sqrt{1 + y'^2} &\Rightarrow x y'^2 = c_1^2 (1 + y'^2) \Rightarrow x y'^2 = c_1^2 + c_1^2 y'^2 \Rightarrow x y'^2 - c_1^2 y'^2 = c_1^2 \\ \Rightarrow y'^2 (x - c_1^2) = c_1^2 &\Rightarrow y'^2 = \frac{c_1^2}{x - c_1^2} \Rightarrow y' = \pm \frac{c_1}{\sqrt{x - c_1^2}} \Rightarrow y = \pm \int \frac{c_1 dx}{\sqrt{x - c_1^2}} \end{aligned} \tag{2.5}$$

$$\Rightarrow y = \pm c_1 \int \frac{d(x - c_1^2)}{\sqrt{x - c_1^2}} \Rightarrow \boxed{y = \pm 2c_1 \sqrt{x - c_1^2} + c_2}, \tag{2.6}$$

where c_2 is another integration constant.

3 Geodesic: Shortest path on a Circular Cylinder, Three Ways

3.1 Using One Dependent Variable $z(\phi)$

Show that the shortest path between two points on a circular cylinder is along a helix. Do this with the assumption that, $z(\phi)$ may be written as a function of ϕ in cylindrical coordinates (r, ϕ, z) with r being a constant. The equation of a helix in cylindrical coordinates is $z = C_1 \phi + C_2$ where C_1 and C_2 are constants.

3.1 solution

The length of the line using cylindrical coordinates (r, ϕ, z) can be written as

$$J = \int \sqrt{(dr)^2 + (r d\phi)^2 + (dz)^2} = \int \sqrt{(Rd\phi)^2 + (dz)^2} \tag{3.1}$$

where the integration limits are at two points on the cylinder, and we have imposed the equation of a cylinder $r = R$, where R is the constant radius of the cylinder. Since we only have two variables, z and ϕ , we can choose that the z is the dependent variable, and ϕ is the independent variable giving

$$J = \int \sqrt{(R d\phi)^2 + \left(\frac{dz}{d\phi} d\phi\right)^2} = \int \sqrt{R^2 + z'^2} d\phi, \tag{3.2}$$

where $z' \equiv \frac{dz}{d\phi}$. We make J stationary with Euler's equation,

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial z} - \frac{d}{d\phi} \frac{\partial f}{\partial z'} = 0 \tag{3.3}$$

where

$$f = \sqrt{R^2 + z'^2}. \tag{3.4}$$

This gives

$$0 - \frac{d}{d\phi} \left(\frac{z'}{\sqrt{R^2 + z'^2}} \right) = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{z'}{\sqrt{R^2 + z'^2}} = c_1, \tag{3.5}$$

where c_1 is a constant of integration. Solving for z we get

$$\begin{aligned} z' = c_1 \sqrt{R^2 + z'^2} &\Rightarrow z'^2 = c_1^2 (R^2 + z'^2) \Rightarrow z'^2 (1 - c_1^2) = c_1^2 R^2 \Rightarrow z' = \frac{c_1 R}{\sqrt{1 - c_1^2}} \\ \Rightarrow \int z' d\phi = \int \frac{c_1 R}{\sqrt{1 - c_1^2}} d\phi &\Rightarrow \int dz = \frac{c_1 R}{\sqrt{1 - c_1^2}} \phi + c_2 \Rightarrow \boxed{z = \frac{c_1 R}{\sqrt{1 - c_1^2}} \phi + c_2}, \end{aligned} \tag{3.6}$$

which is an equation of a helix.

3.2 With Two Dependent Variables

Show that the shortest path between two points on a circular cylinder is along a helix. Do this using cylindrical coordinates with the variables $(r, \phi(t), z(t))$. That is $\phi(t)$, and $z(t)$ are dependent on an independent variable t , and r being a constant. Note: You do not have to solve the t dependence of ϕ and z .

3.2 solution

The length of the line using cylindrical coordinates (r, ϕ, z) can be written as

$$J = \int \sqrt{(dr)^2 + (r d\phi)^2 + (dz)^2} = \int \sqrt{(R d\phi)^2 + (dz)^2} \tag{3.7}$$

where the integration limits are at two points on the cylinder, and we have imposed the equation of a cylinder $r = R$, where R is the constant radius of the cylinder. Given that $\phi(t)$, and $z(t)$ are dependent on an independent variable t we have

$$J = \int \sqrt{\left(R \frac{d\phi}{dt} dt\right)^2 + \left(\frac{dz}{dt} dt\right)^2} = \int \sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2} dt, \tag{3.8}$$

where $z' \equiv \frac{dz}{dt}$, and $\phi' \equiv \frac{d\phi}{dt}$. We make J stationary (minimum) with the Euler equations,

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial z} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial z'} = 0 \quad \frac{\partial f}{\partial \phi} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial \phi'} = 0 \tag{3.9}$$

where

$$f = \sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}. \tag{3.10}$$

This gives

$$0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{z'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} \right) = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{z'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} = c_1 \Rightarrow \frac{z'}{c_1} = \sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}, \tag{3.11}$$

and

$$0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{R^2 \phi'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} \right) = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{R^2 \phi'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} = c_2 \Rightarrow \frac{R^2 \phi'}{c_2} = \sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}, \tag{3.12}$$

where c_1 and c_2 are constants of integration. Subtracting the last equation in 3.12 from the last equation in 3.11 gives

$$\frac{z'}{c_1} - \frac{R^2 \phi'}{c_2} = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{1}{c_1} z' dt = \frac{1}{c_2} R^2 \phi' dt \Rightarrow \frac{1}{c_1} \int dz = \frac{1}{c_2} R^2 \int d\phi \Rightarrow \boxed{z = \frac{c_1}{c_2} R^2 \phi + c_3}, \tag{3.13}$$

which is an equation of a helix.

3.3 With an Equation of Constraint and Three Dependent Variables

Show that the shortest path between two points on a circular cylinder is along a helix. Do this using cylindrical coordinates with the variables $(r(t), \phi(t), z(t))$ all dependent on an independent variable t , and with the constraint that $r = a$, where a is a constant. Note: There's not much different between this and the last sub-problem.

3.3 solution

The length of the line using cylindrical coordinates (r, ϕ, z) can be written as

$$J = \int \sqrt{(dr)^2 + (r d\phi)^2 + (dz)^2} \tag{3.14}$$

where the integration limits are at two points on the cylinder. Given that $r(t)$, $\phi(t)$, and $z(t)$ are dependent on an independent variable t we have

$$J = \int \sqrt{\left(\frac{dr}{dt} dt\right)^2 + \left(r \frac{d\phi}{dt} dt\right)^2 + \left(\frac{dz}{dt} dt\right)^2} = \int \sqrt{r'^2 + r^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2} dt \tag{3.15}$$

where $r' \equiv \frac{dr}{dt}$, $\phi' \equiv \frac{d\phi}{dt}$, and $z' \equiv \frac{dz}{dt}$. We make J stationary (minimum) with the Euler equations,

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial r} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial r'} + \lambda(t) \frac{\partial g}{\partial r} = 0 \quad \frac{\partial f}{\partial \phi} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial \phi'} + \lambda(t) \frac{\partial g}{\partial \phi} = 0 \quad \frac{\partial f}{\partial z} - \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial f}{\partial z'} + \lambda(t) \frac{\partial g}{\partial z} = 0 \tag{3.16}$$

where $\lambda(t)$ is the Lagrange undetermined multiplier,

$$f = \sqrt{r'^2 + r^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}, \tag{3.17}$$

and we have the equation of constraint $g(r) = r - R = 0$, where R is the constant radius of the cylinder. The equation of constraint $g(r)$ makes solving for $r(t)$ trivial, giving $r(t) = R$ and $r' = 0$. The Euler equations for ϕ and z give

$$0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{R^2 \phi'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} \right) + 0 = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{R^2 \phi'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} = c_1 \Rightarrow \frac{R^2 \phi'}{c_1} = \sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}, \tag{3.18}$$

and

$$0 - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{z'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} \right) + 0 = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{z'}{\sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}} = c_2 \Rightarrow \frac{z'}{c_2} = \sqrt{R^2 \phi'^2 + z'^2}, \quad (3.19)$$

where c_1 and c_2 are constants of integration. Subtracting the last equation in 3.18 from the last equation in 3.19 gives

$$\frac{z'}{c_2} - \frac{R^2 \phi'}{c_1} = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{1}{c_2} z' dt = \frac{1}{c_1} R^2 \phi' dt \Rightarrow \frac{1}{c_2} \int dz = \frac{1}{c_1} R^2 \int d\phi \Rightarrow \boxed{z = \frac{c_2}{c_1} R^2 \phi + c_3}, \quad (3.20)$$

which is an equation of a helix.

4 Minimum Area of Revolution

A surface is generated by revolving a curve $y(x)$, that connects two points in the x - y plane, around the x axis. Find this curve such that the surface area is a minimum. Consider using the second form of Euler's equation.

4.0 solution

We minimize

$$J = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} 2\pi y ds = 2\pi \int_{x_1}^{x_2} y \sqrt{(dx)^2 + (dy)^2} = 2\pi \int_{x_1}^{x_2} y \sqrt{1 + y'^2} dx \quad (4.1)$$

where $y' \equiv \frac{dy}{dx}$. For J to be a minimum, J must be stationary. J will be stationary if

$$f \equiv y \sqrt{1 + y'^2} \quad (4.2)$$

satisfies Euler's equation,

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial y} - \frac{d}{dx} \frac{\partial f}{\partial y'} = 0. \quad (4.3)$$

Plugging in f into Euler's equation gives

$$\sqrt{1 + y'^2} - \frac{d}{dx} \left(\frac{yy'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) \Rightarrow \sqrt{1 + y'^2} - \frac{yy''}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - \frac{y'^2}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} + \frac{yy'^2 y''}{(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}} = 0, \quad (4.4)$$

where $y'' \equiv \frac{d^2 y}{dx^2}$. Multiplying by $(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}$ gives

$$(1 + y'^2)^2 - yy''(1 + y'^2) - y'^2(1 + y'^2) + yy'^2 y'' = 0 \quad (4.5)$$

$$\Rightarrow 1 + 2y'^2 + y'^4 - yy'' - yy'^2 y'' - y'^2 - y'^4 + yy'^2 y'' = 0 \quad (4.6)$$

$$\Rightarrow 1 + y'^2 - yy'' = 0 \Rightarrow 1 + y'^2 = yy''. \quad (4.7)$$

Assuming that y' can be expressed as a function of y we get,

$$y'' = \frac{dy'}{dx} = \frac{dy'}{dy} \frac{dy}{dx} = \frac{dy'}{dy} y'. \quad (4.8)$$

Therefore

$$1 + y'^2 = y \frac{dy'}{dy} y' \Rightarrow \frac{dy}{y} = \frac{y' dy'}{1 + y'^2} \Rightarrow \int \frac{dy}{y} = \frac{1}{2} \int \frac{d(1 + y'^2)}{1 + y'^2} \Rightarrow \ln y = \frac{1}{2} \ln(1 + y'^2) + c_1, \quad (4.9)$$

where c_1 is a constant of integration. This gives

$$\ln\left(\frac{y}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}}\right) = c_1 \Rightarrow \frac{y}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} = C_1, \quad (4.10)$$

where $C_1 \equiv e^{c_1}$. So

$$y = C_1 \sqrt{1 + y'^2} \Rightarrow y^2 = C_1^2 (1 + y'^2) \Rightarrow y^2 = C_1^2 + C_1^2 y'^2 \Rightarrow y^2 - C_1^2 = C_1^2 y'^2 \quad (4.11)$$

$$\Rightarrow \sqrt{y^2 - C_1^2} = C_1 y' \Rightarrow dx = C_1 \frac{y' dx}{\sqrt{y^2 - C_1^2}} \quad (4.12)$$

$$\Rightarrow \int dx = C_1 \int \frac{dy}{\sqrt{y^2 - C_1^2}} \Rightarrow x = C_1 \cosh^{-1} \frac{y}{C_1} + C_2 \Rightarrow \boxed{y(x) = \cosh \frac{x - C_2}{C_1}}. \quad (4.13)$$

If we used the second form of Euler's equation,

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial x} - \frac{d}{dx} \left(f - y' \frac{\partial f}{\partial y'} \right) = 0 \quad (4.14)$$

with f from equation 4.2 we get

$$-\frac{d}{dx} \left(y \sqrt{1 + y'^2} - \frac{yy'^2}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) = 0 \Rightarrow y \sqrt{1 + y'^2} - \frac{yy'^2}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} = C_1, \quad (4.15)$$

where C_1 is an integration constant. By multiplying by $\sqrt{1 + y'^2}$ we get

$$\Rightarrow y + yy'^2 - yy'^2 = C_1 \sqrt{1 + y'^2} \Rightarrow y = C_1 \sqrt{1 + y'^2} \quad (4.16)$$

which is the same as the first equation in 4.11. So the result will be the same and we see this way is a little quicker.



5 Shape of a Hanging Cable

A cable with uniform linear mass density, and a fixed length l is hung across space while gravity pulls down on it causing the cable to sag between the two points at the ends of the cable. The total gravitational potential energy ($mg y$) from the earth pulling down on the cable is a minimum. What is the general shape of the cable, $y(x)$. Hint: Use the method on page 222 of Thorton and Marion.



Let ρ be the linear mass density of the cable. Letting gravity act in the minus y direction, the gravitational potential energy of the cable is

$$J = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} (dm) g y = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} (\rho ds) g y = \rho g \int_{x_1}^{x_2} y \sqrt{1 + y'^2} dx. \quad (5.1)$$

The constraint that the cable has a total length l can be written as

$$l = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} ds = \int_{x_1}^{x_2} \sqrt{1 + y'^2} dx. \quad (5.2)$$

We set $f = y\sqrt{1 + y'^2}$ and $g = \sqrt{1 + y'^2}$ so for J to be a minimum, it must be stationary, and so (from equation 6.78 in Thorton and Marion)

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial y} - \frac{d}{dx} \frac{\partial f}{\partial y'} + \lambda \left(\frac{\partial g}{\partial y} - \frac{d}{dx} \frac{\partial g}{\partial y'} \right) = 0 \quad (5.3)$$

where λ is a Lagrange undetermined multiplier constant. This gives

$$\begin{aligned} & \sqrt{1 + y'^2} - \frac{d}{dx} \left(\frac{yy'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) - \lambda \frac{d}{dx} \left(\frac{y'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) = 0, \\ \Rightarrow & \sqrt{1 + y'^2} - \frac{y'^2}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - y \frac{d}{dx} \left(\frac{y'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) - \lambda \frac{d}{dx} \left(\frac{y'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) = 0 \\ \Rightarrow & \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - (y + \lambda) \frac{d}{dx} \left(\frac{y'}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} \right) = 0 \\ \Rightarrow & \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - (y + \lambda) \left(\frac{y''}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - \frac{y'^2 y''}{(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}} \right) = 0. \\ \Rightarrow & \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - (y + \lambda) \frac{y'' (1 + y'^2) - y'^2 y''}{(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}} = 0 \quad \Rightarrow \quad \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - (y + \lambda) \frac{y'' + y'^2 y'' - y'^2 y''}{(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}} = 0 \\ \Rightarrow & \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + y'^2}} - (y + \lambda) \frac{y''}{(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}} = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (5.4)$$

Multiplying by $(1 + y'^2)^{\frac{3}{2}}$ gives

$$\begin{aligned} \Rightarrow & 1 + y'^2 - (y + \lambda) y'' = 0 \quad \Rightarrow \quad 1 + y'^2 = (y + \lambda) y'' \quad \Rightarrow \quad 1 + y'^2 = (y + \lambda) \frac{dy'}{dy} y' \\ \Rightarrow & \frac{dy}{y + \lambda} = \frac{y' dy'}{1 + y'^2} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \int \frac{dy}{y + \lambda} = \int \frac{y' dy'}{1 + y'^2} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \int \frac{d(y + \lambda)}{y + \lambda} = \frac{1}{2} \int \frac{d(1 + y'^2)}{1 + y'^2}. \end{aligned} \quad (5.5)$$

We note that we just solved an equation like this from the previous problem in 4.9, but with $y + \lambda \rightarrow y$, and so the solution, from equation 4.13, is

$$y + \lambda = \cosh \frac{x - C_2}{C_1} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \boxed{y(x) = -\lambda + \cosh \frac{x - C_2}{C_1}}, \quad (5.6)$$

so the general shape is a hyperbolic cosine function.

